



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	<u>Journal of Scientific Research and Reports</u>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JSRR_29457
Title of the Manuscript:	Assessment of Stakeholder Involvement in the Management of Yankari Game Reserve Bauchi, Nigeria
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Compulsory REVISION comments		
Minor REVISION comments	<p>Line 20: change “checkmating” to “protecting” Line 32: insert “back”... This was reverted “back” to Line 34-36: The scientific names need to be introduced at this point in the manuscript, rather than waiting until line 86 – 89. For species in line 86 – 89 not introduced in lines 34 – 36, the scientific names of only those species should be listed here. Line 37: YGR is home to one of the largest remaining elephant populations in West Africa with an estimated 348 elephants. Line 43: According to the Nigeria Environmental Study Team [7] Line 47: The YGR in (YGR was defined in line 25) Line 51: This means YGR requires.... Line 53 – 55: Conservation scientists have advocated the inclusion of many partners and an array of stakeholders including the community members in the management and governance of protected areas [10, 11, 12] Line 59: The World Conservation Union [7] also reported... Line 59: Drop “Correlatively” Line 74-75: The YGR (9.5°N, 10.30°E) lies within the Sudan savanna vegetation zone.</p> <p>There is an overuse of the word “abysmal” throughout the manuscript, which means “extremely bad, appalling, dreadful, awful, etc.” This hints of the author’s bias. I would choose some other wording</p>	



SDI Review Form 1.6

<p><u>Optional/General</u> comments</p>	<p>This research would be of more interest on a local scale, unless the author can expand this into a broader application. Currently, it only validates what the YGR and surrounding host communities probably already know. It comes across as merely a report.</p> <p>The YGR population was sampled differently than the host communities, and no explanation was given as to why and how this may or may not affect the responses. I assume this was a simple survey (yes/no responses), and probably education levels or gender would have no affect on responses (in terms of attitude and knowledge differences, especially in host communities), but this is not addressed.</p> <p>Survey, at least as reported here, did not go any further to inquire about suggestions from YGR staff and host communities as to how to get host communities more involved, or even why host communities are not more involved. Is it misperceptions? Attitudes? Education differences? Discovering and analyzing this data would make this research of greater interest to the international community.</p> <p>In questions related to the YGR staff responses on the involvement of the host communities in the management of the reserve, what is the real difference between the two questions (Table 2):</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. "Are host communities involved in the management of YGR?" <p>And</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. "Does management involve host communities in protecting YGR?" <p>The manuscript is well-written, and in terms of word-smithing little is needed. My only concerns are the content of the manuscript.</p>	
--	--	--

Reviewer Details:

Name:	<i>Roger A. Williams</i>
Department, University & Country	<i>School of Environment and Natural Resources, The Ohio State University, USA</i>