

1 **Short Research Article**

2 **Induction of resistance in poplar to *Melampsora***  
3 ***larici-populina* using**  
4 **L-form bacteria**

5

6 **Abstract**

7 Poplar (*Populus* spp.) is a deciduous tree that belongs to the Family Salicaceae and grows in  
8 most parts of the northern hemisphere from subarctic to subtropical regions [of Britain or India](#)

9. Poplars are

10 susceptible [for to](#) a variety of bacterial and fungal diseases, [and t](#)he rust caused by  
*Melampsora*

11 sp. is one of the most serious diseases of poplars. [In this study, it was observed that](#)  
[Symbiosis symbiosis](#) of stable L-form bacteria of *B.*

12 *subtilis* with rooted poplar cuttings grown under greenhouse conditions inhibited the  
13 development of rust pustules on leaves [on subsequentwhen exposure exposed](#) to  
*Melampsora larici*

14 *populina*. The development of rust symptoms was monitored by counting the pustule  
15 number, by observing the leaf discs under the light microscope. [This The](#) plant- L-form  
symbiosis

16 [shows showed](#) an antagonism to fungal pathogen [and this hasindicating a](#) promising  
implications for the use of

17 this L-form bacteria as a biocontrol agent for poplars against the rust pathogen.

18

19 **Key words** – L-form bacteria, Plant-L-form association, Induced resistance, *Populus* spp.,

20 *Melampsora larici-populina*, Leaf disc assay.

21

22 **1. Introduction**

23 Plants, like humans and other animals exhibit disease symptoms [and these diseaseswhich](#)  
are

24 caused by different animate and inanimate agents. Different approaches [may beare](#) used to  
25 prevent, mitigate or control plant diseases (Pal & Gardener, 2006). Conventional disease

26 control is based on application of various chemicals and resistance breeding. The

27 development of highly effective pesticides seemed [ed](#) to offer instant [answers solutions](#) to the  
threat of

28 disease, but the environmental pollution caused by excessive use and misuse of

29 agrochemicals has [led to considerable](#) changes [sd in](#) people's attitudes towards their use.

30 Induced disease resistance is an interesting alternative for the plant protection, which is  
based

31 on the activation of existing resistance mechanisms in the plants [and, it It](#) is effective against  
a

32 broad spectrum of plant pathogens (Van Loon *et al.*, 1998).

33 **UNDER PEER REVIEW**

Induced resistance in plants can be local or systemic. At least 32 two forms of induced

34 resistance, systemic acquired resistance (SAR) and induced systemic resistance (ISR) have

34 been characterized as two distinct phenomena based on the types of inducing agents and  
the  
35 signalling pathways of the host that result in resistance expression (Sticher *et al.*, 1997, Van  
36 Loon *et al.*, 1998). Expression of localized necrosis caused by the inducing pathogen is the  
37 major characteristic of SAR. This necrosis can be either a hypersensitive response (HR) or a  
38 local necrotic lesion caused by the virulent pathogen. SAR is also dependent on salicylic acid  
39 signalling and expression of genes of pathogenesis-related proteins (PR proteins) (Sticher *et al.*  
40 *et al.*, 1997, Hammerschmidt, 1999). ISR is induced by certain strains of plant growth  
41 promoting rhizobacteria (PGPR). Unlike SAR, ISR is not associated with necrosis. ISR  
42 depends on perception of ethylene and jasmonic acid and it is not associated with expression  
43 of genes for PR proteins (Van Loon *et al.*, 1998).

44 L-form bacteria have modified or no cell walls (Madoff, 1986) and are capable of  
45 forming non-pathogenic symbioses with a wide range of plants (Paton, 1987). [TheseThis](#)  
[form of](#)  
46 [symbioses symbiosis have been shown to](#) confer resistance against subsequent  
challenge by other fungal  
47 and bacterial pathogens (Walker *et al.*, 2002, Daulagala & Allan, 2003) and hence the  
48 association has [a the](#) potential as a novel system for biological control. However, the  
mechanisms  
49 for the protection are not well known. But according to Daulagala & Allan (2003), the  
50 activity of chitinase, a major PR protein of L-form treated Chinese cabbage plants were  
51 higher than the control plants treated with 5% (w/v) mannitol and this suggested that L-forms  
52 [have](#) induced the activity of pathogenesis-related proteins in plants. In the detached leaf and  
53 the whole plant bioassays, the L-form treated Chinese cabbage plants, [challenged with](#)  
[subjected to](#)  
54 *Botrytis cinerea*, consistently showed lower grey mould disease indices than seedlings  
treated  
55 only with mannitol. Further [more](#), the resistance expressed by the L-forms [is was](#) similar to  
the  
56 resistance observed in plants colonized with the mutants of *Colletotrichum magna*, which  
[arewere](#)  
57 no longer pathogenic, but very successfully colonized a wide range of host plants as  
58 endophytes (Redman *et al.*, 1999). As it is not still clear whether this resistance in plants is  
an  
59 SAR type, it is interesting to study how these non-pathogenic microbes like L-form bacteria  
60 triggered defence responses in plants.  
61

62 Poplar (*Populus* spp.) occur naturally in most parts of the northern hemisphere [of Britain or](#)  
[India?](#) from subarctic  
63 to subtropical regions (Bean, 1976). Poplar is a deciduous tree that belongs to the Family  
64 Salicaceae. There are about 35 species of poplar trees. This tree grows mostly in temperate  
65 climates. Poplar trees grow quickly and provide enough shade. Wood can be used for  
**UNDER PEER REVIEW**  
numerous purposes such as for the production of plywood, musical instruments 66 like guitars,  
67 drums and often used in paper industry.  
68 Poplars are susceptible for a variety of bacterial and fungal diseases. Rust caused by  
69 *Melampsora* sp. is one of the most serious diseases of poplars. Among the *Melampsora*  
70 species, *M. larici-populina* is the most widespread and frequent rust species described in

71 poplar and the principal rust fungus [concern responsible](#) in Britain.. The fungus passes through  
72 [subsequent different](#) stages of its life cycle on an alternate host, larch (*Larix* sp.). Poplar rust is easily  
73 recognized by the masses of yellow/orange fungal spores that cover the under surface of the  
74 leaves. After a few weeks, the leaves blacken, curl up and fall prematurely. Apart from a  
75 reduction of growth due to foliage loss, sometimes there is a failure of [current year's](#) shoot  
76 maturation. Imperfect maturation can lead to a dieback of the shoot, even to the extent that  
77 the entire plant may die.  
78 There is no pesticide approved for use against poplar rust in woodlands in the UK.  
79 Trials elsewhere in Europe have indicated that economically acceptable but partial control of  
80 the disease can be achieved [by](#) one or two annual applications of a fungicide with curative  
81 and  
82 persistent properties. However, chemical control of plant diseases is expensive, sometimes  
83 physically impracticable and in many cases environmentally undesirable. Use of resistant  
84 clones is one of the best disease-control strategies; however, the number of highly resistant  
85 clones is limited, making biological control an attractive disease-control alternative.  
86 Therefore, there is no doubt that in the future, disease control in plants, presently provided by  
87 chemicals, mainly by fungicides and bactericides, will be replaced by new disease control  
88 technologies emerging from the knowledge of plant-microbe interactions.

## 89 2. Materials and methods

90

### 91 2.1 Plant material and growth conditions

92

93 All experiments were performed on rooted cuttings of hybrid poplar clones (*Populus*  
94 *trichocarpa* x *Populus deltoides*) 'Beaupré', 'Boelare' and the *Populus nigra* clone  
95 'Vereecken'. Cuttings were obtained from Rothamsted Research Institute, Hertfordshire, UK  
96 and grown in pots containing compost in a greenhouse at the Department of Plant & Soil  
97 Sciences, University of Aberdeen.

98

99

UNDER PEER REVIEW

### 100 2.2 Rust isolates

101 Rust isolate 16B was obtained from Rothamsted Research Institute, Hertfordshire, UK and  
102 maintained at -15°C. The infection types of the rust isolates were assigned from 0 (immune) to

103 4 (highly susceptible) according to Pei *et al.* (1996).

104 The clone 'Vereecken' was highly susceptible (infection type 4) to the isolate 16B while the  
105 clones 'Beaupré' and 'Boelare' were immune (infection type 0) to the same isolate.

106

107

#### 108 Poplar clone Rust isolate 16B

109 *P. deltoides* x *P. trichocarpa* 'Beaupré' 0 - immune

110 *P. deltoides* x *P. trichocarpa*, 'Boelare' 0 - immune

111 *P. nigra* 'Vereecken' 4 - susceptible

112

Formatted: Superscript

### 113 **2.3 L-form bacteria and growth conditions**

114 Stable L-form bacteria derived from the cell-walled form of *Bacillus subtilis* NCIMB 8054,  
115 ATCC 6633 (Allan, 1991; Allan *et al.*, 1993) were maintained on L-phase medium (LPM)  
116 (Allan, 1991) supplemented with 5% (v/v) inactivated horse serum (HS) (Gibco, UK). Liquid  
117 cultures were initiated by inoculating agar blocks (approx. 2 x 2 cm) containing good surface  
118 growth of L-forms from a 2d old streak plate into L-phase broth (LPB). Cultures on LPM  
119 were maintained at 30° C. Liquid cultures were maintained at 30° C in a shaking incubator  
120 (Gallenkamp, UK) at the speed of 60 rev min<sup>-1</sup>.  
121

### 122 **2.4 Association of *B. subtilis* L-forms with poplar leaves**

123 The clones 'Vereecken' and 'Beaupré' were used for the association of L-form bacteria  
under

124 greenhouse conditions. The surface growth of L-form bacteria from a 3d old LPM plates  
was

125 harvested with 5 % (w/v) sterile mannitol solution. Optical density OD<sub>600</sub>

126 (Spectrophotometer, CE1010, CECIL, Cambridge, UK) of the L-form suspension was

127 adjusted to approx. 0.7 (approx. 10<sup>7</sup> CFU ml<sup>-1</sup>). Fully expanded mature leaves from healthy

128 shoots were selected (3 shoots from each plant). Approximately 20 petioles of selected  
leaves

129 [at of the](#) same maturity on three shoots were treated by injecting 200 µl of L-form  
suspension at a

130 single site closer to the attachment point [to of](#) the mother plant (2 cm from the attachment  
point)

131 using a hypodermic syringe and a 23G needle. A similar number of petioles in control plants

132 were treated identically with 5% (w/v) mannitol. Two sets of leaves were treated with

UNDER

## PEER REVIEW

forms and mannitol solution for leaf assays. The petioles of all injected 133 leaves were tagged

134 accordingly. All plants were maintained in the greenhouse at the Department of Plant & Soil

135 Sciences, University of Aberdeen. The leaves were collected for the leaf disc assay from

136 plants after 5 and 10 days of injecting L-forms and mannitol respectively.

137

### 138 **2.5 Leaf disc assay on leaves injected with L-form bacteria and mannitol**

139 The method of Pei *et al.* (2004) was followed with some modifications. Leaves (3-5) were

140 collected from two sets of plants of both clones after 5 and 10 days of injecting L-forms and

141 mannitol solution. Three sets of leaves; L-form injected leaves, non-injected leaves in L-  
form

142 injected plants and mannitol injected leaves were collected. Fifteen leaf discs of 16 mm

143 diameter (5 from each type) were cut with number 10 cork borer. The leaf discs were kept

144 (abaxial surface up) on sterile blotting paper bridges soaked in sterile distilled water in 25 (5

145 x 5) compartments of 10 x 10 cm<sup>2</sup> square [Petri petri](#) dishes. To each compartment of the

[Petripetri](#)

146 dish, 1.5ml of sterile distilled water (SDW) was added before placing the blotting paper

147 bridge and the leaf disc. The spores of the rust isolate 16B were suspended in SDW

148 containing Tween 20 (1 drop for 100 ml) and the concentration of the spore suspension was

149 adjusted the of 30,000 spores ml<sup>-1</sup>. Each of the 15 leaf discs in a single [Petri petri](#) dish were

150 inoculated with 50 µl of the spore suspension (4 droplets on each disc) by means of a sterile

151 micropipette. Petri dishes were incubated in a growth cabinet at 16°C with 16 h day<sup>-1</sup>

152 illumination.

153

#### 154 **2.6 Association of *B. subtilis* L-forms with poplar stems**

155 The clone 'Vereecken' was used for the association of L-form bacteria under greenhouse  
156 conditions. The L-form suspension was prepared as previous experiment. The young stems  
157 were treated by injecting 200 µl of L-form suspension at a single site using a hypodermic  
158 syringe and a 25G needle. A similar number of branches were treated identically with 5%  
159 (w/v) mannitol. All injected branches were tagged accordingly. Both treated and control  
160 plants were maintained in the same greenhouse. The leaves were collected from both  
treated

161 and control plants after 10 and 15 days of the treatment. The leaf disc assay was carried  
out

162 similar to the previous experiment using the spores of *Melampsora* isolate 16B.

163

164

165

UNDER PEER REVIEW

#### 166 **2.7 Disease assessment**

167 The discs were observed daily for the disease development after for 13 days from of  
inoculation. The

168 pustules on each leaf disc were counted (three replicates) daily and the number of pustules  
169 per leaf disc was calculated. The number of days until the appearance of the first symptom  
170 (incubation period) was also calculated. Thirteen days after inoculation, the distribution of  
171 pustules on leaf discs were recorded using a digital camera.

172

#### 173 **3 Results and discussionDiscussion**

174

175 Stable L-forms derived from the cell walled form of *Bacillus subtilis* NCIMB 8054, ATCC  
176 6633 have previously been shown to associate with plants such as Strawberry (Ferguson *et al.*,  
177 *et al.*, 2000) and

178 Chinese chinese cabbage (Tsomlexoglou *et al.*, 2003). Similar to the work done by  
Ferguson *et al.*, (

179 2000) in this present study also leaves and stems of 3 months old Poplar plants were  
injected

180 with L-forms of *B. subtilis* and 5% mannitol as treated and control tests and grown under  
181 greenhouse conditions.

182

183 The development of rust symptoms on leaf discs obtained from treated and control plants  
and

184 inoculated with *Melampsora* spore suspension was monitored by counting the pustule  
185 number, by observing the discs under the light microscope (Mazurek, UK). Of the two  
poplar

186 clones selected, the clone *Populus trichocarpa* x *Populus deltoides* 'Beaupré' was immune  
to

187 the rust isolate 16B (Pei, M.H., pers. comm.) and this clone showed an incompatible

188 interaction between the pathogen and the host plant. Therefore no visible rust symptoms  
189 were  
190 appeared on any of the leaf discs of 'Beaupré' obtained from the leaves injected with L-form  
191 bacteria or mannitol with *Melampsora* isolate 16B. No necrosis was observed, but darker  
192 regions were developed and remained restricted to the inoculated areas of leaf discs.  
193 The *P. nigra* clone 'Vereecken' was highly susceptible to the same rust isolate and showed  
194 a  
195 compatible interaction. By 5 days after inoculation with *Melampsora* spores, chlorotic  
196 areas where the droplets of rust spores were kept. **By 7 days**On the 7<sup>th</sup> day, uredinia were  
197 readily seen on  
198 the leaf discs as orange pustules (Fig 1).

Formatted: Superscript

UNDER PEER REVIEW

199  
200

**Figure 1** Development of chlorotic areas and rust pustules on leaf discs 201 of clone  
'Vereecken'

202 (obtained from leaves where petioles were injected with L-form bacteria) inoculated with  
203 spores of *Melampsora* isolate 16B.

204

205 Counting of pustules on leaf discs **was** started after 5d of inoculation of rust spores as there  
206 were no visible disease development on discs during the first five days of inoculation. The  
207 average numbers of pustules developed from D6 to D13 in leaves after 5 and 10d of  
injecting

208 L-form bacteria and mannitol to the leaf petioles are shown in Figures 2 and 3.

209

Yellow pustules in  
chlorotic areas

UNDER PEER REVIEW

Figure 2 - The average numbers of pustules developed from D6 to 210 D13 in leaves of clone  
211 'Vereecken' after 5 days of injecting L-form bacteria and mannitol to the leaf petioles ( -  
212 L-form injected leaves; - Non-injected leaves from L-form injected plants; - Mannitol  
213 injected leaves). Average number of pustules of fifteen leaf discs per each treatment is  
214 shown. Error bars represent standard errors of number of pustules of fifteen leaf discs.

215

216

217 Figure 3 - The average numbers of pustules developed from D6 to D13 in leaves of clone  
218 'Vereecken' after 10 days of injecting L-form bacteria and mannitol to the leaf petioles ( -  
219 L-form injected leaves; - Non-injected leaves from L-form injected plants; - Mannitol  
220 injected leaves). Average number of pustules of fifteen leaf discs per each treatment is  
221 shown. Error bars represent standard errors of number of pustules of fifteen leaf discs.

222

223

224

225 The leaf disc assay showed that the discs obtained from the leaves where the petioles were  
226 treated with L-forms had the minimum average number of pustules followed by the  
227 non- injected leaves obtained from the same set of plants. Comparing the leaves collected  
228 after 5 and 10 days of injecting L-form bacteria (Figures 2 and 3 respectively), pustules  
229 developed in all three sets of leaves (L-form injected leaves, non-injected leaves in L-form  
230 injected plants and mannitol injected leaves) collected 10 days after injecting L-forms were  
231 significantly lower in numbers than that of 5 days. The **most highest** number of pustules

**were** ~~was~~

232 visible on leaf discs obtained from mannitol treated leaves. This indicates that the leaves  
233 treated with L-form bacteria **have been shown to be** ~~were~~ protected from **subsequent**  
**excess** inoculation of

234 the pathogen *Melampsora* **and at** ~~At~~ the same time L-forms **have** moved within the plant  
from

235 the injected leaves to the non –injected leaves showing lower number of pustules in these

UNDER PEER REVIEW

leaves than the mannitol treated leaves in control plants. Previously 236 it **has had** been  
postulated

237 that L-forms of *Pseudomonas syringae* **may might** have evoked a systemic acquired  
resistance

238 response (Hammerschmidt, 1999) to provide protection against pathogenic bacteria in both

239 **Chinese chinese** cabbage and bean (Amijee *et al.*, 1992; Waterhouse *et al.*, 1996) **but**  
**perhaps** ~~Perhaps~~

240 different control mechanisms **may might have** ~~occurred~~ depending on the type of bacteria  
and/or the plant.

241

242 There is previous evidence to prove the movement of L-form bacteria of *B. subtilis* within  
the

243 plant tissues from the point of their inoculation (Ferguson *et al.*, 2000; Tsomlexoglou *et al.*,

244 2003). An ELISA that was selective for the L-forms of *Bacillus subtilis* showed that L-forms

245 **have** moved up to 32-42 cm along the stolon tissues of strawberry from the point of  
injection.

246 Within 4 days of infection, the L-forms were detected in leaves and new stolons showing  
247 their systemic distribution. (Ferguson *et al.*, 2000). Daulagala & Allan (2003) reported that

248 when **Chinese chinese** cabbage seeds were imbibed in suspension of *Pseudomonas*  
*syringae* pv.

249 *phaseolicola* NVR5 1281 L-forms and grown in pots and subsequently sprayed with a  
250 conidial suspension of *B. cinerea*, leaves of 31 days old seedlings showed consistently  
lower

251 disease development than the mannitol treated seedlings. However, **similar according** to  
the work done

252 by Ferguson *et al.* (2000), in this **present** study, the L-forms were injected to the stems and  
253 petioles, rather than imbibed during seed germination. During injection, since there is a  
great

254 possibility for the bacteria to enter the vascular system or the intercellular spaces via the

255 wound and systemically distribute within the plant, in this **present** study, leaves collected

256 after 5, 10 and 15 days of injecting L-forms and mannitol solution.

257

258 Considering the observations of leaf disc assay performed using the leaves obtained from

259 plants where the L-forms and mannitol were injected to stems, significantly lower number of  
260 *Melampsora* pustules were **developed** observed on leaves from L-form treated plants  
collected 10 days  
261 after the treatment (Fig. 4) than that of 15 days (Fig. 5).

## UNDER PEER REVIEW

262

Figure 4 - The average numbers of pustules developed from D6 to 263 D13 in leaves of clone  
264 'Vereecken' after 10 days of injecting L-form bacteria and mannitol to the stem  
265 ( - leaves obtained from L-form injected plants; - leaves obtained from Mannitol  
266 injected plants). Average number of pustules of fifteen leaf discs per each treatment  
267 is shown. Error bars represent standard errors of number of pustules of fifteen leaf discs.

268

269

## UNDER PEER REVIEW

Figure 5 - The average numbers of pustules developed from D6 to D13 in leaves of clone  
'Vereecken' after 15 days of injecting L-form bacteria and mannitol to the stem ( - leaves  
obtained from L-form injected plants; - leaves obtained from Mannitol injected plants).

Average number of pustules of fifteen leaf discs per each treatment is shown. Error bars  
represent standard errors of number of pustules of fifteen leaf discs.

A common reaction of many plants in response to attack by pathogens is the synthesis of  
pathogenesis related

(PR) proteins. **Chitinases** chitinases as one of the major pathogenesis related proteins have  
been suggested

to play a major role in defence responses of plants against pathogen attack. In combination with  
 $\beta$  -1,3 glucanases, chitinases lyse hyphal tips of fungi (Daulagala, 2014) or involved in releasing  
elicitors

that **can** could activate plant defence mechanisms (Ryan, 1988). When L-forms of  
*Pseudomonas syringae* pv.

*phaseolicola* NVRS 1281 were associated with **Chinese** chinese cabbage seedlings, compared  
with the  
mannitol treated control seedlings, a significant induction of chitinolytic enzymes was detected in  
seedlings with 4-methylumbelliferol substrates (Daulagala & Allan, 2003).

### 270 4. Conclusion

271 This current research clearly revealed that L-form bacteria **can** could protect poplar plants  
against

272 the pathogen *Melampsora larici-populina* which **causes** caused rust disease in poplars.  
This finding

273 suggests that L-form bacteria offer an alternative biocontrol strategy for pathogenic

274 microorganisms. According to the previously reported research findings of L-form plant

275 associations, L-forms have protected plants against both bacterial and fungal pathogens in  
a

## UNDER PEER REVIEW

manner similar to systemic acquired resistance associated with 276 the induction and  
expression

277 of PR proteins in plants. Therefore, further work is needed to investigate the nature of this  
L278

form-plant symbiosis and the mechanism of protection of poplar plants against the fungal

279 pathogen *Melampsora larici-populina*.

## 280 **References**

281 Allan EJ. Induction and cultivation of a stable L-form of *Bacillus subtilis*. Journal of Applied  
282 Bacteriology. 1991; 70: 339-343.

283

284 Allan EJ, Amijee F, Tyson RH, Strang JA, Innes CMJ, Paton AM. Growth and physiological  
285 characteristics of *Bacillus subtilis* L-forms. Journal of Applied Bacteriology. 1993; 74: 588-  
286 594.

287

288 Amijee F, Allan EJ, Waterhouse RN, Glover LA, Paton AM. Non-pathogenic association of  
289 L-form bacteria (*Pseudomonas syringae* pv. *phaseolicola*) with bean plants (*Phaseolus*  
290 *vulgaris* L.) and its potential for biocontrol of halo blight disease. Biocontrol, Science and  
291 Technology. 1992; 2: 203-214.

292

293 Bean WJ. Trees and shrubs hardy in the British Isles. 1976; Vol. III, John Murray Ltd.,  
294 London, UK.

295

296 Daulagala PWHKP, Allan EJ. L-form bacteria of *Pseudomonas syringae* pv. *phaseolicola*  
297 induce chitinases and enhance resistance to *Botrytis cinerea* infection in Chinese cabbage.  
298 Physiological and Molecular Plant Pathology. 2003; 62: 253-263.

299

300 Daulagala PWHKP. Expression of chitinase with antifungal activities in ripening Banana  
301 fruit. Tropical Plant Research. 2014;1(3): 72-79.

302

303 Ferguson CMJ. ELISA detection of *Bacillus subtilis* L-forms in Strawberry. 1998; PhD  
304 Thesis, University of Aberdeen, UK.

305

306 Ferguson CMJ, Booth NA, Allan EJ. An ELISA for the detection of *Bacillus subtilis* L-form  
307 bacteria confirms their symbiosis in strawberry. Letters in Applied Microbiology. 2000; 31:  
308 390-394

## UNDER PEER REVIEW

309

Hammerschmidt R. Induced disease resistance: how do induced 310 plants stop pathogens?  
311 Physiological and Molecular Plant Pathology. 1999; 58: 53-53.

312

313 Hammerschmidt R. L-forms of plant pathogenic bacteria: a new means of inducing host  
314 defenses? Physiological and Molecular Plant Pathology. 2003; 62: 251-252

315

316 Madoff S. Introduction to the bacterial L-forms. In: The Bacterial L-forms., New York,  
317 Maecel Dekker. 1986; 1-20.

318

319 Pal K K, Gardener BM. Biological Control of Plant Pathogens. The Plant Health Instructor.  
320 2006. DOI: 10.1094/PHI-A-2006-1117-02.

321

322 Paton AM. L-forms: evolution or revolution? Journal of Applied Bacteriology. 1987; 63:  
323 365-371.

324

325 Pei MH, Royle DJ, Hunter T. Pathogenic specialisation of *Melampsora epitea* var. *epitea* on

326 *Salix*. Plant Pathology. 1996; 45: 679–90

327

328 Pei MH, Ruiz C, Bayon C, Hunter T. Rust resistance in *Salix* to *Melampsora larici-epitea*.

329 Plant Pathology. 2004; 53: 770–779.

330

331 Ryan CA. Oligosaccharides as recognition signals for the expression of defense genes in 332 plants. Biochemistry. 1988; 27: 8879-8883.

333

334 Redman RS, Ranson JC, Rodriguez RJ. Conversion of the pathogenic fungus

*Colletotrichum*

335 *magna* to a non-pathogenic endophytic mutualist by gene disruption. Molecular Plant

336 Microbe Interactions. 1999;12: 969-975.

337

338 Sticher L, Mauch Mani B, Metraux J P. Systemic acquired resistance. Annual Review of

339 Phytopathology. 1997; 35: 235-270.

340

341 Tsomlexoglou E, Daulagala PWHKP, Gooday GW, Glover LA, Seddon B, Allan EJ.

342 Molecular detection and  $\beta$ -glucuronidase expression of gus-marked *Bacillus subtilis* L-form

UNDER PEER REVIEW

bacteria in developing Chinese cabbage seedlings. Journal 343 of Applied Microbiology. 2003;

344 95: 218–224

345

346 Van Loon, LC, Backer PAHM, Pieterse CMJ. Systemic resistance induced by rhizosphere

347 bacteria. Annual Review of Phytopathology. 1998; 36: 433-438.

348

349 Walker R, Ferguson CMJ, Booth NA, Allan EJ. The symbiosis with *Bacillus subtilis* L350

forms with Chinese cabbage seedlings and inhibit conidial germination of *Botrytis cinerea*.

351 Letters in Applied Microbiology. 2002; 34: 42-45.

352

353 Waterhouse RN, Buhariwalla H, Bourn D, Rattray EJ, Glover LA. CCD detection of *lux*

354 marked *Pseudomonas syringae* pv. *phaseolicola* L-forms associated with Chinese cabbage

355 and the resulting disease protection against *Xanthomonas campestris*. Letters in Applied

356 Microbiology. 1996; 22: 262-266.

UNDER PEER REVIEW